

Technologies for Disciplining Bodies and Spaces in Abra (1823-1898)

RAYMUNDO D. ROVILLOS
University of the Philippines Baguio

Spanish attempts to subjugate the Cordillera became particularly intense from the middle to the last part of the 19th century due to revived colonial interest in the Philippine archipelago with the opening of the Suez Canal in the middle of the century (Corpuz 1997, Legarda 1999). There was also a renewed effort to stimulate commerce and agriculture and exploit the great wealth of the island's timber and mineral resources. New economic policies and programs in the archipelago were triggered by the sudden collapse of the Spanish Empire during the Napoleonic invasion. In its attempt to regain its lost glory and consolidate its possessions, Spain continued its territorial projects in the now independent America and maintained its links with the overseas provinces of Cuba, Puerto Rico and the Philippines (Capel 1994, 58). In these territories Spain launched new, more organized projects that would systematize the generation of knowledge about colonized bodies and spaces. Such endeavors included new surveys and geographical reconnaissance projects which were to serve as the basis of a modern administrative structure (Capel 1994).

The Spaniards desperately needed to take possession of the Cordillera because of its reportedly rich timber and mineral (gold and copper) deposits, resources that they needed in their bid to compete with the new colonial powers. However, Spanish pacification efforts had always been frustrated by the natives of the Cordillera, collectively labeled "Igorot" by the Spaniards, who had resisted Spanish conquest since the 17th century. The period 1823-1898 saw significant results in Spanish efforts to consolidate its stronghold in Abra, then a newly established province. Because it was the take-off point for the Spanish official war against the Igorots, Abra became militarily and politically strategic. The Spaniards labeled the pacified natives of Abra as "Tinguian," and gave this term the connotation of "noble-savage," distinguishing the Tinguian from the Igorots who were seen as uncivilized and therefore deserving of conquest.

The Spaniards systematically employed several technologies or methods of surveillance and control such as road construction, creation of market centers (*tiangges*), census taking and medicine. In this paper, I refer to these colonial projects as "technologies of discipline,"

as defined by Michel Foucault (1977). For Foucault, “technologies” are those sets of operations and procedures by which knowledge and power are joined around the objectification of the body (1984, 17). The aim of disciplinary technology is to forge a “docile body that may be subjected, used, transformed and improved” (Foucault 1975, 198). This is done through drills and training of the body, standardization of action over time, and the control of space. Discipline proceeds from an organization of individuals in space, and requires a specific enclosure of space. Once established, this grid permits the certain distribution of individuals who are to be disciplined and supervised (Foucault 1984, 206-207).

Throughout the period of pacification, native bodies became arenas of political contestation between the colonizers and the colonized. Colonialism gazed at the native body with desire and contempt. The native body represented an “otherness” that required colonial surveillance and control. Through census-taking, native bodies and spaces were systematically named, categorized and controlled. As an instrument of coercion, medicine itself became linked with the civilizing mission. But while native bodies were repressed, they also became spaces of resistance against colonial intrusions.

Every space that the roads traversed was delineated and marked as object of surveillance, mission and measurement (McKay 1999, 91). As the boundaries of these colonial spaces were mapped out, new communities were created, local leaders declared, and boundaries of local/ethnic identities established. From the perspective of colonialism, the proximity of natives to the road network was a step in disciplining their disorderly past and bringing them to a progressive and modern present and future (McKay 1999, 91).

The setting up of market centers (*tiangges*) in the *pueblos* (colonized towns) was a more outright technological tool to create binary oppositions between the assimilated, “orderly” natives, the Tinguians, on the one hand, and the uncivilized, “disorderly” Igorots on the other. The *tiangge* was part of a colonial design to attract the natives from the peripheries toward the center. It was supposed that once settled in the *pueblos*, the natives could be compelled to accept colonial hegemonic discourse and practice.

This ethnohistory of Abra provides an opportunity to analyze how the methods of disciplinary power were employed to help establish a modern state during the middle to late phase of Spanish colonialism in the Philippines.

Naming and Counting the Body

The need to take stock of the number of bodies within a definite space became an important element of modern state-building in the 19th century throughout the world. This was done through the census, a systematic approach to naming and counting individual bodies. Census-taking was tied to the State's practical need to know the exact location, identities, and numbers of its constituency in order to collect taxes more efficiently and generate revenues from them. Broadly speaking, census was a key method of order, undertaken by modernizing states in order to simplify the process of governance, and to make legible the unintelligible (Scott 1998, 25), the better to regulate, control and discipline them.

Spanish effort at "counting" the Tinguians was clearly connected to their civilizing and modernizing mission. From 1823 onwards, through *reduccion* or *plan de agrupacion*, the missionaries started concentrating the Tinguians, who numbered 8,000 (Keesing 1962, 137). The processes of pacifying the heathen communities converged with the potential of exploiting natural and human resources so as to create new local spaces and identities. To facilitate the work, Abra was separated from Ilocos Sur in 1846, becoming a new province (Keesing 1962, 137). With the continuous settlement of the Tinguians, new Tinguian communities gradually emerged in the peripheries of Ilocos Sur, and the Tinguians in the new villages of Abra increased in number.

The desire of the colonizer to consolidate its conquered spaces in Abra is shown in the way the people were categorized and listed by the census. In the Spanish colonial imagination, Abra was a space at the periphery of Ilocos Christian towns: wild, ferocious, yet attractive and full of promise. Because of this, the categorization of settlers in the province was based on their location in the savage-civilized continuum.

Ethnohistorian Felix Keesing reveals the perspective of one of those who made the report and census. When the Spanish surveyor and geographer Augustin de la Cavada conducted the census in 1876, he categorized the population into the following: Christian *Indio*, *Infieles Indio*, Spaniard, Chinese, Filipino, and *Mestizo*. According to the German Hans Meyer, the Tinguians were located between the Ilocanos and Igorots (Keesing 1962, 140).

Spanish census-takers in Abra characterized and categorized peoples according to their own image of themselves as Christians and *pueblo* dwellers. In creating a census that revolved around the dimensions of race and ways of living, the Spaniards distinguished between people already pacified and those needing to be subjugated and controlled. In the process, the dichotomy between the center (lowland/*pueblo* settlers) and periphery (upland/*rancheria* settlers) was created. The Spanish construction of different Tinguian and

Igorot identities led to further distinctions among the upland dwellers: between those who lived in destitution and those who had a good life (Keesing 1962, 135); between the savages and semi-savages; and between those who should be in and out of Abra.

The objectives of census-making were to illustrate in numbers the colonized people, locate each individual in the constructed category (Anderson 2003, 169), and trace the origin and development of the human subject, from cradle to grave. Through numerical census, the province was gradually put to order and control. The census became an instrument that helped fortify colonial spaces and simultaneously inscribe new identities through the processes of relocating and rearranging native bodies. This can be clearly observed in the establishment of *pueblos* in a coercive and militaristic manner, as outlined by Lieutenant Colonel Manuel Scheidnagel (1880, 203):

1. Subdivide the pueblo population and Igorot rancherias into municipal districts where there is sufficient number in the former, and wherein each district is able to collect more than one thousand tributes;
2. Each group will assume the identity of the most significant locality (place) that joined the formation;
3. After carrying out these two processes within a definite time frame, a small detachment of armed forces shall be established under a military chief of the district where the settlement of the native population will be included as well as a church and mission priest's house, and in that manner the districts eventually become parishes;
4. All Igorots who refuse to be baptized shall pay tribute to the Department of Treasury the same amount imposed on the indios, while those who accept the Christian religion shall be exempted from paying half of all the treasury and local tributes.¹

During the last quarter of the century, Abra, along with other provinces of the country, was mapped out as a distinct province, with a (seemingly) definite number of populations (*Censo de las Filipinas:1903* 1905). A closer demographic analysis reveals the dramatic decrease in population due to the spread of epidemics and migration out of the community mainly to evade colonial policies like forced labor.

Until the onset of the last decade of the 19th century, the exact number of Tinguians had not been fully captured in the census. This was due to the customary practice of changing names when a person suffers from a severe illness. This made the Tinguians difficult to track down. To deal with this problem, a proposal was forwarded in 1893 that would facilitate the conduct of census particularly among the Tinguians (*Memorias Medicas* 1893). The guideline required the listing of name of each newly-born child, together with the names of

parents, place and date of birth. This approach examined the name and ancestry of individuals, a form of surveillance of kinship relations. This method obviously served to expand the reach of the census and to fill in the gaps.

Curing the Body

Throughout the colonized world, including the Cordillera and Abra, the Europeans used Western medicine as one of their instruments in colonizing and controlling their "other." Developments in biomedicine reflected efforts at subjugating the non-civilized peoples in the colonies (Comaroff and Comaroff 1992, 215).

The core of this philosophy was shown in the complex Web of Life, the interrelation of each organism in the planet, from the most simple to the most complex (Gordon 1991, 153; Turner 1992, 32). The Web of Life traces its beginning to the bacteria, and finds its culmination in the human being. Human beings were also organized according to their location in the unilinear stages of becoming civilized (Gordon 1991, 434-435), ultimately based on proximity to or distance from the European color, appearance and behavior. The white man was considered the highest type of creation, while the non-Europeans were assigned to the lowest rungs (Turner 1996, 204-205).

Until the mid-18th century modern medicine had no definite form (Comaroff 1992, 222). It was a discipline that obstinately competed with other medical systems such as traditional and non-western medicines. The terrain was still wide and the competition relatively fair. While western medicine had not reached its hegemony of "ultimate truth," it gradually asserted itself as the true system. It also became an instrument of colonialism, an adjunct of the civilizing mission and the narrative of modernization/progress on which it was predicated.

The medical system that emerged in the Dark Ages in Europe was based on the Greco-Roman tradition. This tradition was also influenced by the teachings of Arabian medicine, based largely on the so-called humoral theory which posited that a person is healthy if and when it is able to balance the various elements from the environment that it needs to ingest. It was also believed that the increase in elements was seasonal so that the spread of each type of disease was also believed to follow a seasonal rhythm. This tradition of medicine was appropriated by the Church during the Dark Ages, when its influence was strongest (Foster and Anderson 1978, 57-59). This process led to the eventual marriage of religion and medicine, whereby medicine "introduced the dominant Philosophy regarding relationship between body and context, object and morality" (Comaroff 1985, 224).

The Spaniards introduced and spread this medical system

throughout the colonized world. Malaria, for example, came from the Italian word *mal'aria* which means bad air; the Spaniards called it *paludismo*, derived from *palus* which means swamp, because they believed that the disease was caused by the emissions of mud and decayed plants from the swamps (De Bevoise 2002, 142-143).

When the Spaniards came to the Philippines, they had to confront the indigenous system of medicine. With colonial contact, contrasting worldviews on health, hygiene and faith surfaced. For the friars, dirt was the source of disease and diminished health; hence, the body was to be isolated from, or purged of, dirt. A typical friar thus lamented and sought to change the attitude of Igorot parents toward hygiene and health:

We have many times asked the parents of these children, "Why don't you bathe your children? Don't you know that dirt is the cause of fevers, smallpox and many other sicknesses? Their answers have been very proper to the state of savagery in which they are still found: "Why do you want us to bathe them when they are going to get dirty again? They are alright as they are." And there has not lacked somebody who told me: "What would become of us if nobody died? We would be sure to die of hunger." (Perez 1988, 82).

Still, for the Spaniards, bathing should be moderate: they felt that what is deemed good should not be diminished but should not be overdone either. They worried about some Filipinos who bathed more frequently than they did because they also considered the practice as bad (Brewer 2001, 40).

What first caught the attention of the Spaniards was skin disease which, for them, proved the connection between a dirty environment and illness. Manuel Buzeta observed among the Tinguians and Igorots "a kind of skin disease in the groin which was of red whitish color," noting that "rarely does an individual escape from this disease, more commonly found in adults than those of young age." According to the natives, the disease was acquired from sleeping near the fire, but for Buzeta:

This sickness ought to be attributed to too much filth, wrong and deficient food, and perhaps to the many hungry and tubercular dogs which they eat. Moreover, since they say it is contagious, its swift and rapid spread is easily explained especially when one takes into account the custom of unmarried men and widowers spending the night squeezed in a filthy room. (Buzeta 1850-51, 13-15).

Buzeta also singled out the filthy environment as the cause of the high incidence of malaria and chicken pox in the mountain villages. But for the Igorots, chicken pox and other forms of disease were caused by

their interaction with the Christian/lowland communities. This notion partly explains the vigilance with which they guarded the pathways leading to their villages, to prevent the entry and spread of disease among their ranks (Antolin 1970, 21, 31).

The Igorots changed residence after performing the necessary rituals to avoid disease (Perez 1902, 234). Buzeta added that the Igorots also avoided sick persons who they left alone untreated. He underscored the difference between this Igorot practice and the Christian teachings of love and devotion for fellowmen, sympathy and care for the sick, and charity for the needy (Buzeta 1850-51, 15-16). The Spaniards easily took this as yet another manifestation of the savagery of the Igorots and Tinguians, and proof of the Spaniards' accusation that the Igorots did not know how to relate well with other human beings.

With scientific advances during the 18th and 19th centuries, medical practices in France, Britain, Prussia and neighboring places aspired to and achieved undisputed authority. Spain, however, apparently lagged behind these developments and innovations in medical science (De Bevoise 2002, 100).

It was during the first decade of the 18th century that Europeans discovered the prophylaxis for diseases that were caused by viruses. It was said that this technology of preventing diseases had long been used in Arabia and India, including China, Turkey and Greece, but only at the level of folk medicine. An example was the practice of placing something from the wart of pox on human skin to provide relief from the disease. From Turkey this method was brought to Western Europe with the help of the Greek doctors, and then became widespread and popular in the English countryside (McNeill 1998, 255-261).

The method of vaccination improved in 1798 when Edward Jenner, an English doctor, published his discovery which was enthusiastically welcomed throughout Europe (McNeill 1998, 257-258). Spain introduced the method of prophylaxis to Mexico a few years after Jenner published his findings, which also immediately spread throughout the New World. Vaccines were first brought into the Philippines during the first decade of the 19th century (De Bevoise 2002, 102), and reached Pangasinan in 1805 (Mangaldan 1950, 42-43).

Meanwhile, there were also great strides in determining the exact causes of diseases. One of these had to do with the identification of bacteria which could be seen through the microscope. The discovery of bacteria that caused diseases like cholera, typhoid, and tuberculosis happened during the last quarter of the 19th century in the laboratories of France and Germany. A germ theory identifying microbes as the cause of diseases soon became widespread (Ileto 1995, 59-60).

In Europe, the evolution of medicine toward a biomedical system happened alongside its separation from the ministerial healing of the ecclesiastics. The Spanish colonial administration gradually adjusted

its public health programs according to the changes taking place. It appointed doctors and persons who studied medicine as *medico titular*, to take care of the health of its colonized subjects. On account of new perspectives on disease, explanations for their causes were partially dissociated from the supernatural and traditional diagnoses.

In the last decades of the 19th century, Dr. Agustin Llanera, *medico titular*, dreamed of having a modern public health program for Abra. However, his frustration is evident in letters like this one:

I believe I have written enough in previous *memorias* about the cleaning of the towns, but nothing has been done about it nor any measure made among all those I have proposed. The pagans living in very remote *rancherías*, as well as those within the Christian towns continue with their primitive customs of burying cadavers beneath their houses, not after letting several days pass practicing their most ridiculous and anti-hygienic functions or feasts which they celebrate after the death of one of them. When will these causes of constant infection disappear from the province? I have also already said that when the Christian towns have control over the pagans in all the *rancherías* within their (geographic) jurisdiction and the latter, all of them, are made to do what the Christians are being made to do and when the same laws which we all comply with are made to apply to them. Everything that does not follow this, aside from being contrary to hygiene, is a failure for the government of our most beloved Spain (Memorias Medicas 1886).

For the sake of public health, the colonial administration ordered the cleaning of houses and established a cemetery in Abra. After two years, Dr. Llanera reported on the status of health and sanitation in the province: "The cemetery was well-located, but its maintenance was neglected especially during harvest season. There was only one clinic in Bangued" (Memoria: Provincia de Abra 1884-1891).

The prevention of disease was also done through smallpox vaccination which was efficiently implemented in Abra. Dr. Llanera explained that the establishment of vaccination centers was the reason for the prevention of the spread of an epidemic in the province in 1895 (Memorias Medicas 1895).

Carried out in tandem with census, the project of vaccination became a mechanism to identify bodies and locate them in definite spaces. The colonial administration closely supervised the implementation of this project especially among the Tinguians who allegedly "wrought havoc by spreading diseases" (Memorias Medicas 1895). However, after a few years, Llanera lamented the scarce funds being allocated for vaccination, the poor quality of the vaccines, and the lack of manpower for implementation (Memorias Medicas 1891). These problems were particularly worse in the more remote villages inhabited

by the Tinguians. Up until 1891, there were still problems regarding

the lack of vaccine administrators in the *rancherías* of unconverted Tinguianes located in areas within the jurisdiction of Christian towns.

In other *rancherías*, where there used to be one or two individuals who would perform the job without compensation in exchange for the privilege of exemption from rendering service in government projects, these days, I do not have anybody who wishes to assume those posts because they no longer enjoy the privilege (Memorias Medicas 1891).

On November 7, 1893, Joaquin Arespacochaga, a government official, recommended that vaccination and census-making should be conducted simultaneously to expedite these jobs among the Tinguians and “to ensure maintenance of permanent identities of the people” (Reduccion de Infieles 1893). Vaccination required the filling out of forms which extracted information about the natives.

To prevent the further spread of small pox, infected persons had to be isolated from the rest of the population. Dr. Llanera reported that the success of the efforts to prevent the spread of the epidemic may be attributed to the construction of a *camarin* or shelter on an island in the middle of Abra River, where infected persons were settled, given food and disinfectants, and provided with a caregiver (Memorias Medicas 1892).

The colonial government failed to wean the natives away from their “pagan” and “uncivilized” ways of treating diseases. The natives continued to practice their indigenous medical practices and beliefs. On one hand, this may be explained by the fact that modern medical systems and practices had not reached the villages of the province of Abra. On the other hand, the persistent practice of using indigenous ways of treating illnesses may be seen as native resistance against colonial efforts to push for modern medicines and practices alongside colonial rule.

The well-esteemed traditional healers, the *aniteras/aniteros*, became the special target of missionaries and government officials. This is because the *aniteras/aniteros* were not only healers but also served as the traditional priests, the mediators of ordinary mortals and the spirits or *anitos* of the ancestors. They were therefore threats to the Christianization project. Colonial hatred (or anxiety?) of the *aniteras* may be gleaned from this report of the Commandante Politico Militar (C.P.M.) of Abra in 1876:

There is one old woman in each *rancheria* who is the cause of all the foolishness taking place among them, and who is always believed as someone who is wise; this woman plays the role of a priest, doctor,

adviser everything, in short, because she is always consulted on all difficult matters they confront (Rancherías 1880).

The *anitera/o* was virtually the repository of knowledge on medicinal plants and vines which, based on their experience, have healing powers (Campa 1894, 16). The missionaries identified some of these medicinal plants, such as *ajenjibre*² (Rodríguez 1895, 99), a decoction from which was normally drunk by women who had just given birth on the belief that the mix could cleanse the remaining blood inside their womb.

As early as 1763, Antonio Mozo had already reported two kinds of important medicinal objects: “one is from the bark of a tree, which I do not remember anymore, which can be found in the northern part of Ilocos Sur. They pulverize this bark and apply it as poultice on the wound.” Mozo also said that he had personally witnessed how the bark was able to heal the wound of a child who was stepped over by a horse. Seashells found in the shores of the town of Namacpacan were also thought to have medicinal value. “These seashells were pulverized and mixed with drinking water. It was an effective cure for typhoid and high fever” (Mozo 1763, 220).

This shows that while the Spaniards officially declared indigenous knowledge systems as unscientific, some of them, like Mozo, were convinced of the benefits that could be derived from such knowledge and practices. However, there were many medicinal plants whose use the missionaries never found out. The Tinguians believed that only the *aniteras/os* should know the names of these plants and their therapeutic value, hence they should not share this privileged information with others or the plants would lose their healing powers.

To diminish the power of the *anitera/o*, the missionaries and Augustinian friars did exactly what they had done in other parts of the country (Brewer 2001, 281-299). They ordered the burning or burying of the ritual instruments used by the *aniteras/os*, and strictly prohibited the baptized from having any interaction with the *aniteras/os* who were labeled as the embodiment of evil (Aparicio 1957, 170-171). A government official also went to the extent of suggesting that these *aniteras/os* “should be banished to remote places so that their influence on the natives could be stopped” (Rancherías 1895).

Disciplining the Body

As colonial power spread from Abra Valley and nearby mountains, the colonial government thought it necessary to consolidate its possessions. It attempted to do this by intensifying their surveillance and control of the native body. After familiarizing themselves with the population by

counting, through the census, the bodies under their jurisdiction, they then tried to “tame” and discipline these “wild” and “dirty” bodies by imposing health policies and programs.

In the ascetic tradition of Christianity, the body was perceived as a sinister, troublesome and dangerous thing. It had to be carefully suppressed and controlled through cultural processes. The body was also seen as the vehicle of emotions and desires that are difficult to control and manage (Turner 1996, 11; Porter 1991, 217). The need to control the body was an enduring element in Western philosophy and religion. For 19th century Western philosophy the body had engendered anarchy and had to be disciplined through persuasion, coercion and, ultimately, physical force.

In the 19th century, the colonial administration used various “technologies” such as health, sanitation and clothing to attract, tame, and control the Tinguian body. One of the first things that Fr. Bernardo Lago did when he arrived in Pidigan in May 1823 was to “cover the naked body of the native” (Aparicio 1957, 175). The Augustinian missionary immediately solicited donations of clothes and distributed these to the Tinguians. This facilitated the conversion to Christianity of several Tinguians in Pidigan and San Quintin. It was also reported in the history of the mission in Pidigan and San Quintin that:

They returned home as Christians – the men minus the decoration of their long hair which they had permitted to be cut off, and the women without the glittering gold and pearl ornaments on their tattooed arms and in their oiled hair. Celebrations were held when they arrived home (quoted in Schmitz 1971, 98).

The native youth gradually abandoned their custom of sporting long hair. The friars demanded that before the natives entered school, they should first cut their hair, wash their face and clean their bodies. The schools also rewarded natives for decent dress, cleanliness, and obedience. Because of this,

It was finally possible to make those filthy shocks of hair disappear, and above all, new interest aroused in the youth of today. Now it is no longer rare to find some youths who, breaking out of the mould of tradition, cut their hair, and comb it parted either in the middle or on the side, using a handkerchief instead of a turban to cover their head (Perez 1988, 146).

Colonial control of the “disgusting nakedness of the native” (Perez 1902, 146) was also done in a vicious manner. In 1868, Governor Esteban de Peñarrubia evicted from the *pueblo* all those who did not get baptism from the Catholic Church. Many of them were Tinguians who were displaced from their homes and whose properties were confiscated (Cole 1915, 245).

Moreover, any Tinguian who wore native attire was banned from entering the *pueblo*. As a result of this policy, many natives were forced to convert to Catholicism. Reversion to their old customs could lead to imprisonment or some other form of punishment. At the same time, also because of this policy, many natives became *remontado* or *alzado*, people who went to the mountains to escape or evade colonial policies.

Colonial policy toward the naked body was reinforced by an order, dated December 31, 1891, that aimed at improving the "moral, material and administrative conditions" of Abra. Following the suggestion of a parish priest in Bangued, the government instructed that "Igorots and Tinguians should not be allowed into the capital unless they are in complete attire... such an arrangement would be a big step towards civilization" (Report of Manuel de Rioja, Memoria: Provincia de Abra 1884-1891).

While the Spaniards particularly in Abra forced the natives to wear western and/or lowland clothes, some of them vehemently opposed the idea. The more notable (or notorious?) among the latter was Sinibaldo de Mas who advised that only the Spaniards should be allowed to wear a neckerchief. He added that the *Indios* and *Mestizos* throughout the archipelago should be identified with their loose shirts or *camisas* and their own choice of hat. Only the *principalias* should be allowed to wear a jacket. Mas also criticized the religious for having allegedly destroyed the distinction of ranks among the natives, saying that though this could be taken as a demonstration of benevolence and democratic impulse, "the destruction of rank also destroys the principle of ambition, the stimulus for economy and work" (Mas 1903-1909, 61).³

Such was how the body became an arena of political and social contestation.

Another method of colonial surveillance and control of the body was the "continuous and vigilant persecution of persons in illicit relationships." This particularly refers to the indigenous practice of men and women living together and engaging in sexual relations outside of marriage. In 1891, a parish priest from Dolores, Abra recommended that the *cabeza de barangay* should report this practice to the *governadorcillo*, who in turn should report it to the parish priest (Memorias Medicas 1891).

Sex outside of marriage was contrary to the teachings of Catholicism. The body, according to Christian/Catholic discourse, is a sacred thing as therein dwelt a person's soul. When the physical body is tainted, so is the soul. Contrarily, the natives believed that sex was a prerequisite to marriage to test the capacity of the woman's body for childbearing. Marriage was only desirable or possible with and after the woman's pregnancy. In indigenous discourses of the body, the women's capacity to give birth spells the survival of the entire kin or community and it was on this account that they were esteemed by

the community.

These cases reveal how the modern methods of disciplining bodies during the 19th century attempted to inscribe order and legibility by separating the disciplined and clothed bodies from those that were undisciplined and naked. This made it possible to identify the “wild” natives or *infielos* and ultimately overcome the major barriers to the establishment and consolidation of colonial spaces—the Igorottes. Surveillance and control of these elements was also pursued through the vigorous construction of roads.

The Roads to Domination

The construction of roads subdivided the countryside into units of colonial rule. Each community traversed by roads was demarcated and established as object of colonial surveillance, conversion and measurement. As the colonizers assiduously established the boundaries and while they sketched their possessions on the maps, the colonial gaze created new communities, anointed local leaders and constructed the boundaries of place and identity (McKay 1999, 91). The narratives that follow, culled from colonial documents and therefore presenting the voices of the colonial agents themselves, vividly illustrate this point.

Historically, the interaction between and among the people from the Ilocos, the valley and mountains of Abra, and the rest of the Cordillera was coursed through the riverine nexus, the Abra river and its tributaries (Azurin 1993, 53). The Spaniards saw the strategic role of the Abra River especially in trade, and carefully planned how to control and profit from the transportation system through the use of rafts. On September 19, 1847, Ramon Tajonera, *Governador General y Politico* (GMP), proposed the establishment of a transportation system consisting of rafts that would bring people and goods from the mouth of the Abra River to the interior villages, at a price of 6-8 *cuartos* per person. Tajonera explained that this system would help Abra and Vigan generate revenues that could be used in building roads in the two provinces (Ereccion de Pueblo 1846-1849).

The central colonial government welcomed the proposal of Tajonera with enthusiasm. In a letter dated September 29, 1847, a certain Rosales⁴ commended the proposed transportation system, using rafts, in Talamey-Abra River. However, he recommended that fare should be reasonable, that the persons and products being loaded should be monitored, and that the Governor of Abra should decide whether the project could be managed by the provincial government or contracted out, whichever proved more advantageous (Ereccion de Pueblo 1846-1849).

The *principales* of Abra and Vigan became hindrances to the

colonial plan. On January 16, 1848, GMP Ramon Tajonera complained about the lack of interest among the *principales* in their proposed transport system that was to be manned by 20 persons (Ereccion de Pueblo 1846-1849). The *principales* allegedly demanded concessions like paying nothing to the government and having no *balsas* but theirs to leave Talamey. The *principales* of Vigan said that it was a losing venture as the fares collected would not cover the wages. Tajonera added that there was little interest (*poca resolucion*) on the part of natives because they were not accustomed to this type of project. Consequently, he suggested that the Department of Treasury (*Hacienda*) fund the initial operations of the project. The project was launched in February 1848 and started operating that same year (Ereccion de Pueblo 1846-1849).

The colonial government attempted to divert the flow of social interaction away from the river to the roads. An initial step along this goal was the construction of the Talamey-Gamabang road in 1869-1871. The provincial governments of Abra and Ilocos Sur cooperated in the pursuit of this project. Gobernador Politico-Militar Esteban Peñarrubia explained in December 1869 that the two provinces would benefit from the traffic of information/communication, persons and cargos (Ereccion de Pueblo 1846-1849).

The road system was to replace the raft system that connected Talamey to Banaoang, the "only safe road going back and forth the same place." Peñarrubia added that this was to be so unless the *pueblo* (town) people wanted to be like the *infielos* (savages) "who were capable of climbing the rough pathways because of their awesome agility and customary hiking through rocky mountains." The road also became a marker of the boundary between Ilocos Sur and Abra. Work started on July 18, 1870 and the road was formally opened in July 1871 (Ereccion de Pueblo 1846-1849).

The roads connected the rancherías (barrios) from the peripheral to the central towns of Abra and Northern Luzon. On January 30, 1881, Don Jose Diaz y Sala, GPM of Abra, designated the *Commandante Coronel* of Engineering to explore the possibility of opening a road that would connect the province of Abra and Ilocos Sur. The road could be built in a place called *Bocana* meaning "an opening toward the frontier." The official record also reveals that "besides the benefits for the province, the place (*bocana*) is also strategic for the military because the military road of Abra going to Cagayan starts here, and the flow of communication or connection will be complete... from the *bocana* to the Center." (Reduccion de Infielos 1865-1895).

The direct relationship between road building and colonial surveillance, subjugation and control of the peoples of Abra and the Cordillera is clearly established in the case of the road building project that started from San Andres going to Lingay in 1884. The 24-kilometer road linked the Rancheria de San Andres and San Guillermo and Lingay

in the interior of Cordillera. GPM Manuel Scheidnagel explained that the road aimed to connect Abra to Cagayan. He further said that the construction of the road was needed so that:

In the following days, I will be able to reach the interesting places in the Cordillera and to conquer these places militarily, and also to provide benefits to the province as well as its towns or rancherías (Rancherías 1884).

The project began on October 10, 1884 under the supervision of Ysmael Alzate, a Tinguian leader who had served as *governadorcillo* of Bucay for 8 years. Alzate played an important role as a local conduit and mediator in the implementation of colonial policies in Abra. It is therefore necessary at this point to know this man better. Alzate reaped several honors and awards for outstanding performance of his duties and responsibilities as *governadorcillo*. Foremost of these was his success in returning to the Church of Bucay collections amounting to P1, 150 that were taken by thieves, and his eventual capture of the criminal. He was praised for his “countless efforts in assisting the surveys conducted by Eusebio Hernaez, the chief military engineer, to open a military road” (Rancherías 1884). He was also designated by the government as a candidate for the *Ministerio de Ultramar* on May 6, 1871. No less than Queen Isabel extolled Alzate’s services to Abra.

Alzate served as Lieutenant Foreman for 14 years, during which he was awarded a Civil Merit Medal for his imprisonment of several Igorot “criminals.” These Igorots allegedly came down to wreak havoc on their fellow Igorots before the military roads were opened. He also seized 14 natives who escaped while rendering *polo y servicio* for the construction of a military road.

In several instances, Alzate served as the official representative of the colonial government for significant projects. He was the principal collector of tribute from the planting to selling of tobacco. Again, he received a medal for efficient and effective performance of this duty. The government assigned him as the official interpreter for the Spaniards, especially every time the military, under the leadership of Brigadier General Sabino Gomez, would cross the Gran Cordillera. Jose Diaz, the former Commandante Politico Militar of the province, directed him to journey into the “territory of the Igorot” to gather information on Igorot customs, resources, trade and industry. He represented Governor Jose Diaz y Sala when the responsibilities for governing the rancherías of the newly conquered territories of the Igorots were transferred to the *governadorcillos*. Most of all, Alzate served as the interpreter of the Igorots during the 1887 *Exposicion General de Filipinas* that was held in Madrid. It is important to mention here that Ysmael Alzate was later killed by the Igorots because of his collaboration with

the Spaniards (Dumagat 2004).

On October 6, 1884, Manuel Scheidnagel instructed Alzate to establish immediately a military detachment in Salapay, at a more appropriate place between San Guillermo and Lingay: "You shall not only continue to build new roads in Lingay; you shall also build a station and a stockroom for light materials" (Rancherias 1884).

The case of Alzate shows how the colonizing project created bifurcations among the local population, for example, among the assimilated natives like him and the unassimilated natives like the Igorots who killed him. Having been assimilated into the colonial structures and frameworks of meanings, Alzate acted and behaved in the interest of building a modern state or its local expressions in the province of Abra. Alzate exemplifies the success of the Spanish project of producing docile subjects through instruction and indoctrination. At the same time, his death in the hands of the unassimilated Igorots reveals the porousness of the colonizing project, demonstrating that collaboration with the Spaniards was not the desire of all the native populations. These varied responses to colonialism seem to illustrate modernist dualisms, for example, individual versus society, agency versus structures and practice versus institutions (Mitchell 1988, xii).

On October 11, 1884, Scheidnagel commanded Maximo Galza, Lieutenant of the Infantry, "to conduct a bigger study to determine a more convenient route towards the Cordillera so as to make the necessary assessment, measurement and identification of an exact route in the provincial map" (Rancherias 1884). Galza's work was secured by the establishment of a military detachment at Saladay. As in other road-building projects, the said project was carried out through *prestacion personal* or forced labor (Memoria-Provincia de Abra 1884-1891). The recruitment of *polistas* was done with the help of the *gobernadorcillos* of Abang, San Andres, San Guillermo, Baay, Licuan and Malaqui.

In a letter dated October 19, 1884, Scheidnagel reported on the progress of his project. Again, it called attention to political and military gains:

The construction and repair of all roads in the province has started, alongside repair of military roads. Because of this, I was able to freely infiltrate the rebel pagans and successfully continue the new road of San Andres leading to the Gran Cordillera (Rancherias 1884).

Scheidnagel also wrote of his accomplishments in La Union and Ilocos Sur. According to him, he was able to build good roads in these provinces despite insufficient assistance for his work.

The construction of roads was indeed instrumental in attaining the colonial goal of conquering and controlling the entire Cordillera. The roads also gradually replaced the river as the nexus of upland-lowland

interaction. In 1890 Fray Angel Perez, an Augustinian priest, reported that there were three roads commonly used by the *Indios* in their trade with the Tinguians. The first was Vintar Road which led to the east, passing through the Vintar River before directly proceeding to the east up to Rubrub River. The second road, part of Solsona, passed through the Cura River or Macoton which flowed down to the Nagbilangan River; from here the route passed through Simmalpad up to a thickly-vegetated forest. The third road passed through the town of Dingras (Ilocos Norte) toward Burnay River, crossing the right side of the tributary, the town of Namot. The mountain of Bimmaribar could be seen from the left side of the tributary, and on its upper portion was found a shallow lake (*laguna alta*); from this mountain, on the northern side, it branched out toward the Aragon Mountain (Perez 1904).

Many natives of Abra soon realized the importance of roads in their everyday lives. However, some of them, particularly those in rancherias resisted the construction of roads. Several times, they asked: "Where will these lead us to and what benefits will the roads bring except for the Spaniards and the lowlanders?" (Perez 1988). For the natives, the opening of roads meant their punishment by and subservience to the Spaniards. Because of native resistance, the governor had difficulty building additional roads or maintaining those that they had already built.

***Tiangge*: An Architecture of Surveillance and Control**

While the technology of road building was meant to link the scattered and isolated communities under the close watch of the Spanish authorities, the practice of putting up *tiangges* or markets served to attract various peoples from near and far places in defined spaces (i.e., the pueblo) so they could be better monitored, enumerated and eventually "kept." This process is called by Mitchell as "enframing" or "a method of dividing up and containing, as in the construction of barracks or the rebuilding of villages, which operates by conjuring up a neutral surface or volume called 'space'" (1988, 44).

The integration of the natives into the cash economy through persuasion and/or coercion was central to the civilizing mission. The Spaniards promptly carried out two strategies to achieve this goal. First, they abolished and/or took over traditional centers of trade. Second, they established new trade centers in the lowlands in order to attract the natives from the different communities in and out of Abra. Behind these policies was the politico-military intention to watch and control the natives. Native resistance to and evasion of these colonial schemes again revealed the conflicting meanings of the "good life" from the perspectives of the natives and the Spaniards.

The colonial administration also focused their attention on a major obstacle to their objectives: the contraband trade between the Christians and Igorots which the Spaniards tried to discourage and stop. On December 12, 1846, Gervacio Gironella, *Intendencia General de Ejercito y Hacienda y Superidencia Subdelegada de Filipinas*, urged the Governor General to command the Governor of Abra to prohibit this “illegal” activity:

There is. . . an obstacle, which will always remain as such, if it is not removed. (It is) more or less a strong factor which prevents the Igorots from cultivating tobacco and presenting the income from all that they plant and collect through the illegal trafficking which is being done, undoubtedly, at the expense of large losses to the district.

This trafficking is being done by Christians living near the district. They go up the mountains with pigs, blankets, garments and other articles of little value which they exchange for tobacco. If this is banned, reducing the damaging losses to government coffers... contraband would be blocked and this would attract those pagans to come down to Christian towns to do their purchases and trading. In turn, this would result in much progress in their march to civilization (Ereccion de Pueblo 1846-1849).

Gironella’s account demonstrates the colonizer’s lack of interest in indigenous livelihood systems. In the colonial discourse of modernization and progress, only a cash-oriented economy is appropriate to development. Traditional subsistence economies are deemed backward and primitive.

On December 21, 1847, GPM Claveria, through the *Comandante de Ygorottes* and the *Commandante de Benguet*, came out with an instruction on, among others, prescribed behavior for Christians in commercial dealings with the *infielos* (Ereccion de Pueblo 1846-1849). This was followed on January 2, 1848 by an agreement reached with Comandante Manuel Cevalles regarding trade between the “Ygorotes” and Christians:

I agreed with the Comandante Don Manuel Cevallos regarding the places where the markets should be located. We think that the best way to carry out these barter and sales, which have been carried out in good faith up to this moment, is to allow the Igorots to continue coming down to the Christian towns, as trade between them is sufficiently small in volume.

The previous year, 1847, some 423 Igorots have gone down to Christian towns— without counting among them those from the town of San Eduardo... I am of the opinion, Your Excellency, that the Igorots should continue to be allowed to come down to this point, as their needs will increase with each day, and they will be less strangers to the customs and practices of Christians; and that

they be given two market days every month in this fort, which can be the 19th and 20th of each month, and that they go back up using only the known road from Aringay through (San Eduardo?) to this point. (Letter of Miguel de Loma, Comandancia Politico-Militar del Distrito de Benguet to the Governor General on January 2, 1848, Ereccion de Pueblo 1846-1849)

On March 11, 1848, GPM Ramon Tajonera issued a 12-article guideline governing the creation and operation of markets and *tiangges* to increase government coffers, promote national industry, and prevent smuggling (Ereccion de Pueblo 1846-1849).

From the perspective of the Spaniards, progress could only come to the province if and when there was a central space where people could get together to exchange products and eventually settle permanently. The *tiangges* served as the state's mechanism to appropriate a share of the agricultural surplus, as well as a way to penetrate the processes of rural production, and manipulate the exchange of commodities. At the same time it enabled the state to keep track of the natives, especially the dreaded Igorots, and to impose its authority on the local populace. The European concept of enclosure or enframing and the broader discourse and practice of creating civilized towns inform this idea. In the Philippines, the idea of enclosure was carried out through the colonial policy of *reduccion* or *plan de agrupacion*.

The colonial projects of road construction and *tiangges* were intended to organize, simplify and make legible the life of the ordinary people in Abra. Besides their immediate material benefits to the people, these technologies made the natives more visible to the military and local colonial authorities. Their visibility meant better regulation and control.

Conclusion

In this paper, I discuss the various technologies of discipline, surveillance and control of the native body in Abra, a province of the Cordillera region in Northern Philippines. The interconnected colonial projects of construction of roads, establishment of *tiangge* or market, conduct of census, and the introduction of modern health (medicine) and sanitation systems were systematically utilized to discipline and punish what the Spanish friars, missionaries and government officials had labeled as the "fierce, disorderly, dirty and fetid" body of the natives. These technologies followed the same principles of order which was attained not only through the intermittent use of coercion

but also through continuous instruction, inspection and control of bodies and spaces.

The colonial desire for precision and legibility was based on the high modernist notion that anything ambiguous and unintelligible may be ultimately put into order and rendered measurable and controllable within the framework of a systematic plan. Through such a plan, activities could be organized, controlled and observed. The activities laid out in the plan revealed the framework of meanings that the planners wanted to impose. However, the process of implementing the said projects revealed the tensions and contradictions between western and indigenous discourses on the individual and social body.

This paper attempts to show that the body is indeed a symbol and arena of the structure and relations of power. It appears that the persistence of nakedness during the 19th century, the continued recourse to indigenous practices and beliefs, and the adamant refusal to be subjected to colonial control were not merely innocent and aimless responses from the natives (Tinguians and Igorots). There is considerable weight, as William Henry Scott (1974) has shown in his critical work, in reading this native intransigence as a subversive act, a manifestation of human agency on the part of the natives. Indigenous responses to the building of roads, conduct of census, and the prohibition to wear traditional clothes may reveal counter-hegemonic practices and discourses that only need to be recognized.

Although these indigenous counter-signs did not result in changing the power relations in society at that time, the fact remains that up until the turn of the century several villages in the Cordillera remained free and self-determining "*tribus independentes*."

NOTES

1. Translation by the author. Unless specified otherwise, all quotations from Spanish texts used in this paper were translated by the author with the assistance of Wytan de la Peña of the Department of European Languages, University of the Philippines Diliman.

2. *Amonium zingiber*, L.

3. Mas also condemned the giving of the titles "Don" to the governardorcillos and principales: "Even almost naked Tinguians and Igorots are found with that title which is ridiculous. Let the Filipinos use their own native equivalent of 'Don' and 'Doña.'"

4. Probably an assessor, based on succeeding documents.

REFERENCES

- Anderson, Benedict. 2003. *Imagined communities*. Pasig City: Anvil.
- Antolin, Francisco Fr. 1970. *Notices of the pagan Igorots in the interior of the island of Manila*. Trans. William Henry Scott. Manila: University of Sto. Tomas.
- Aparicio, Teofilo, O.S.A. 1957. El Apostol del Abra [Fray Bernardo Lago-1786-1839]. In *Archivo Agustiniiano: Revista de investigacion historia de los Padres Agustinos Espanoles*, vol. 51. Madrid.
- Azurin, Arnold Molina. 1993. The riverine nexus between Cordillera and Ilocos. In *Reinventing the Filipino: Sense of being and becoming*, 53-70. Quezon City: UP CCSP Publications and University of the Philippines Press.
- Bevoise, Ken de. 2002. *Agents of apocalypse: Epidemic disease in the colonial Philippines*. Quezon City: New Day.
- Brewer, Carolyn. 2001. *Holy confrontation: Religion, gender and sexuality in the Philippines, 1521-1685*. Manila: Institute of Women's Studies, St. Scholastica's College.
- Buzeta, Manuel. 1850-51. *Diccionario geografico, estadistico, historico, de las Islas Filipinas*. 2 vols. Madrid.
- Campa, B. 1894. Los salvajes Igorottes de la Cordillera al Noreste de Pangasinan. *El correo Sino-Annamito* 27: 5-45.
- Capel, Horacio. 1994. The imperial dream: Geography and the Spanish empire in the nineteenth century. In *Geography and empire*, ed. Anne Godlewska and Neil Smith, 58-73. Oxford and Cambridge, Mass.: Blackwell.
- Censo de las Filipinas: 1903*. 1905. Tomo tres: Mortalidad y instruccion. Washington: Oficina de Censo de las Estados Unidos de America.
- Cole, Fay Cooper. 1915. *Traditions of the Tinguian: A study in Philippine folklore*. Chicago: Field Museum of Natural History.
- _____. 1922. *The Tinguian: Social, religious, and economic life of a Philippine tribe*. Chicago: Field Museum of Natural History.
- Comaroff, Jean. 1985. *Body of power, spirit of resistance: The culture and history of a South-African people*. Chicago and London: University of Chicago Press.
- Comaroff, John, and Jean Comaroff. 1992. *Ethnography and the historical imagination*. Boulder, San Francisco and Oxford: Westview Press.
- Corpuz, Onofre D. 1997. *An economic history of the Philippines*. Quezon City: University of the Philippines Press.
- Dumagat, Fay. Interview. 2004. University of the Philippines Baguio, Baguio City, November.

- Ereccion de Pueblo (Abra), 1846-1849, Philippine National Archives (henceforth, PNA), Manila.
- Ereccion de Pueblo (Abra), 1855-1891, PNA, Manila.
- Foster, George M. and Barbara G. Anderson. 1978. *Medical anthropology*. Toronto: John Wiley and Sons.
- Foucault, Michel. 1984. Space knowledge and power. In *The Foucault reader*, ed. Paul Rabinow, 239-256. New York: Pantheon Books.
- Foucault, Michel. 1977. *Discipline and punish: The birth of the prison*. Trans. Alan Sheridan. New York: Random House.
- Gordon, Scott. 1991. *The history and philosophy of social science*. London and New York: Routledge.
- Mangaldan: History and life of the town. 1953. Historical Data Papers, Pangasinan. PNA, Manila.
- Ileto, Reynaldo. 1995. Cholera and the origins of the American sanitary order in the Philippines. In *Discrepant histories: Translocal essays on Filipino culture*, ed. Vicente Rafael, 51-81. Manila: Anvil.
- Keesing, Felix M. 1962. *The ethnohistory of Northern Luzon*. Stanford: Stanford University Press.
- Legarda, Benito Jr. J. 1999. *After the galleons: Foreign trade, economic change and entrepreneurship in the nineteenth-century Philippines*. Quezon City: Ateneo de Manila University Press.
- Mas, Sinibaldo de. 1903-1909. Internal political condition of the Philippines. In *The Philippine Islands 1493-1898*, vol. 52, ed. Emma Blair and James Robertson, 29-90. Cleveland: Arthur H. Clark.
- McKay, Deirdre. 1999. *Imagining Igorots: Performing ethnic and gender identities on the Philippine Cordillera Central*. PhD diss., University of British Columbia.
- McNeill, William H. 1998. *Plagues and people*. New York: Doubleday.
- Memoria Provincia de Abra, 1884-1891, PNA, Manila.
- Memorias Medicas, 1886, PNA, Manila.
- Memorias Medicas, 1891, PNA, Manila.
- Memorias Medicas, 1892, PNA, Manila.
- Memorias Medicas, 1893, PNA, Manila.
- Memorias Medicas, 1895, PNA, Manila.
- Mitchell, Timothy. 1988. *Colonizing Egypt*. Berkeley, Los Angeles and Oxford: University of California Press.
- Mozo, Antonio. 1763. *Misiones de Philipinas de la Orden de Nuestro Padre San Agustin. Noticia historico-natural de los gloriosos triunfos y felices adelantamientos conseguidos en el presente siglo por los religiosos del orden de N.P.S. Agustin en las misiones que tienen a su cargo en las Islas Philipinas, y en Grande Imperio la China*. Madrid.
- Perez, Angel. 1904. *Relaciones de las razas del Norte de Luzon*. Manila: Bureau of Public Printing.

- _____. 1988. *Igorots: Geographic and ethnographic study of some districts of Northern Luzon*. Trans. Enriqueta Fox, Birgit Keith, Anthony Luaria Jr., and William Henry Scott. Baguio City: Cordillera Studies Center, University of the Philippines Baguio.
- Perez, Fr. Elviro J. 1901. *Catalogo bio-bibliografico de los religiosos Agustinos de la Provincia del Santisimo Nombre de Jesus de las Islas Filipinas desde su fundacion hasta nuestros dias*. Manila: n.p.
- Porter, Roy. 1991. History of the body. In *New perspectives on historical writing*, ed. Peter Burke, 206-231. University Park: Pennsylvania State University Press.
- Rafael, Vicente L. 1988. *Contracting colonialism: Translation and Christian conversion in Tagalog society under early Spanish rule*. Quezon City: Ateneo de Manila University Press.
- Rancherias, 1880, PNA, Manila.
- Rancherias, 1895, PNA, Manila.
- Reduccion de Infieles, 1865-1895, PNA, Manila.
- Rodriguez, Mariano. 1895. Etnografia Filipiniana: Los Igorottes de Pangasinan. *El correo Sino-Annamito* 29: 81-115.
- Scheidnagel, Manuel. 1880. *Las colonias Españoles de Asia*. Madrid: Imprenta de Srs. Pacheco y Pinto.
- Schmitz, Josef. 1971. *The Abra Mission in Northern Luzon, Philippines 1598-1955: A historical study*. Series D, Occasional Monograph No. 2. Cebu City: San Carlos Publications.
- Scott, William Henry. 1974. *The discovery of the Igorots: Spanish contacts with the pagans of Northern Luzon*. Quezon City: New Day.
- Scott, James C. 1998. *Seeing like a state: How certain schemes to improve the human condition have failed*. New Haven and London: Yale University Press.
- Turner, Bryan. 1992. *Regulating bodies*. London and New York: Routledge.
- _____. 1996. *The body and society: Explorations in social theory*. London: Sage Publications.

